and Anja Grebe. Of particular importance is the study of the impact of Bolognese art in France, where the birth of classicism is closely connected to such key figures as Sebastiano Serlio and Francesco Primaticcio, well documented in essays by Sabine Frommel, Dominique Cordellier and Sara Benzi. Sabine Frommel highlights Serlio's extraordinary ability to invent a new artistic mode, an amalgam of the grand style of the artist's home town and his thorough knowledge of classical culture, probably learned in the humanistic and antiquary circles of Bologna. In Serlio's sixth book he demonstrates his ability to use both French and Italian architectural languages, as did Primaticcio, whose pictorial and architectural styles were inspired by the decorations in Giulio Romano's Palazzo Te at Mantua, as is evident from the Grotte des Pins or the Hercules' Fountain at Fontainebleau. Of particular significance is the discovery that Primaticcio's fresco of *The Annunciation* in Châalis Abbey was modelled on the intarsia of the *Baptism of St Dominic* in the choirstalls of S. Domenico, Bologna.

Part three is an analysis of Bolognese architecture and engineering as it was exported by emigrant Bolognese artists, and their capacity to invent hybrid languages. They included Aristotele Fioravanti, who promoted Renaissance styles in Russia; Alessandro Pasqualini in Germany and the Netherlands (in essays by Adriano Ghisetti Giavarina, Dmitry O. Shvidkovsky and Christoph L. Frommel) and Raphael's assistant Tommaso Vincidor, who transmitted his master's style to the decoration of the castle of Henry III of Nassau-Breda at Breda in the 1530s (Krista De Jonge and Nicole Dacos).

The fourth chapter focuses on the pan-European character of Bolognese culture, analysing the library of S. Gerolamo in the Certosa (Maria Gioia Tavoni), the impact of Achille Bocchi's *Symbolicae Questiones* (Ilaria Bianchi), Pellegrino Tibaldi's work at the Escorial (Fernando Marías), and the links between Flemish art and Bolognese artists, for example the impact of Northern naturalism on Passerotti (Angela Ghirardi), while Simone Twiehaus and Michele Danieli focus on Denys Calvaert's activity as an engraver.

This multidisciplinary approach to the arts of Bologna provides a complex analysis similar to a great mosaic, in which the tesserae are numerous stimulating suggestions. One of the book's merits is its capacity to go beyond disciplinary and geographical barriers and to demonstrate how Bologna, far from being a 'minor' centre, made a subtle but important contribution to the European Renaissance, acting as a crucible of a variety of personalities, styles and traditions. It provides the indispensable tools for future research on the theme, including a more synthetic approach which is already planned by the organisers of the project of which the present volume is the first tangible result.

Raw Painting: 'The Butcher's Shop' by Annibale Carracci. By C.D. Dickerson III. 93 pp. incl. 59 col. + 2 b. & w. ills. (Kimbell Art Museum, Fort Worth, and Yale University Press, New Haven and London, 2010), $16.95. ISBN 978–0–300–16640–8.

Reviewed by XAVIER F. SALOMON

OVER THE PAST five years, the Kimbell Art Museum in Fort Worth, has published a series of illuminating and beautifully produced small books focusing on masterpieces from the Museum's permanent collection. The volumes so far have ranged in topics from a fifteenth-century German silver sculpture of the Virgin and Child, to a panel from a predella by Fra Angelico, and Frederic Leighton's portrait of the young May Sartoris.[1] In size, content, quantity and quality of illustrations, these books should serve as a model to other institutions on how to present significant new research and material on individual objects from permanent collections. The fourth, and latest, volume in the series is dedicated to Annibale Carracci's *Butcher's shop*.

Like the book, the small size of the painting should not diminish its importance. Surrounded by carcasses and steaks, two butchers are at work in their shop, their red shirts and white aprons echoing the blood and fat of the meat that takes centre stage in the picture (Fig.58). The Kimbell canvas is very closely related to another – much larger – painting by Carracci of the same subject, now at Christ Church, Oxford, and the two should be analysed together. When writing about the Oxford painting in the 1850s, Gustav Waagen found it 'painted in a masterly manner', but could not help observe that the subject 'offended me by the vulgarity of the idea'.[2] Described by John Rupert Martin as 'surely one of the most problematical works to issue from the studio of the Carracci', the painting at Christ Church and the version in Texas have been the centre of wildly diverse theories around the interpretation of their subject-matter.[3] Martin identified the painting, following eighteenth-century English accounts, as a satirical portrait of the Carracci family; Barry Wind saw it as part of a wider comic artistic and literary tradition and perceived erotic overtones in its meaning; for Francesca Rossi, instead, Carracci's was a direct attack on the religious control over butchers exercised by Cardinal Gabriele Paleotti in connection to fasting during Lent.[4] Roberto Zapperi has been the first to try and firmly place the two paintings by Annibale within a rigorous documentary historical background.[5] C.D. Dickerson has followed Zapperi's general approach and the result is a valuable contribution to Carracci studies.

Painted around 1582–83 in Bologna, when Annibale was in his early twenties, the butcher scenes are undoubtedly steeped in a

58. *The butcher's shop*, by Annibale Carracci. c.1582. Canvas, 59.7 by 71 cm. (Kimbell Art Museum, Fort Worth).

familiar context. Rightly dismissing the idea of a family portrait, Dickerson discusses Annibale's family background and the fact that his uncle Vincenzo was indeed a butcher, and that his cousin Ludovico trained as one before becoming a painter. Visually the two canvases are indebted to Northern examples and to paintings of similar subjects by Vincenzo Campi and Bartolomeo Passarotti. Agostino and Ludovico – and maybe even Annibale – trained in Passarotti's workshop before dramatically falling out with their master. Surely this is Annibale's commentary on Passarotti's art. Even though this was not a new type of painting it was a new way of treating the specific theme, investing a genre scene with the grand language of history painting, albeit veined with irony. In the compositions Carracci paid a noteworthy visual debt to Michelangelo and Raphael, as first noticed by Martin.

Dickerson, writing about the Oxford painting, states that 'it must have been a commissioned work, and the person who commissioned it must have been fairly wealthy'. This must, indeed, be the case and the author explores the possibility, proposed by Zapperi in 1989, that Carracci's patrons may have been a wealthy family of Bolognese butchers, the Canobbi. Dickerson's chapter on the 'Butchers of Bologna' is fascinating, the key section of the book, presenting original research on the trade in the city, from livestock markets, to slaughtering facilities and market stalls. The butchers' guild – the Arte dei Beccai – was one of the most prestigious in Bologna and one of only two with a prominent chapel in S. Petronio. The brothers Giuseppe and Girolamo Canobbi were leading members of the guild and later commissioned Annibale's *Baptism of Christ* for the family chapel in SS. Gregorio e Sisto. Dickerson has studied precisely what butcher stalls in Bologna looked like and describes these facilities (some of which were effectively run by the Canobbi family), in particular the so-called *vaso grande* and *vaso piccolo*. A rare photograph is provided, showing via Caprarie around 1912–16, and the entrance to the *vaso grande*, since destroyed.

The Kimbell *Butcher's shop* is most probably an initial study for the larger Christ

Church painting. Annibale's technique is astounding, the brushstrokes bringing to life the texture and weight of meat. Malvasia recounted how Annibale had teased his cook and cat with painted pieces of meat. Dickerson describes Carracci's technique and appropriately compares it to Venetian painting, and in particular to fitting examples by Titian and Tintoretto. Carracci's style and art, however, underwent a profound transformation, which resulted fifteen years later in the Galleria Farnese in Rome. The study of antiquity and the Roman artistic milieu took him far away from his youthful butchers. In a postscript, Dickerson concludes his study of Annibale's painting by looking at it with modern eyes; the legacy of Carracci's fundamental contribution to the history of Western painting manifests itself in the work of artists – among many – such as Jean-Siméon Chardin, Gustave Courbet and Chäim Soutine.

[1] J.C. Smith: *The Art of the Goldsmith in Late Fifteenth-Century Germany: The Kimbell Virgin and her Bishop*, Fort Worth, New Haven and London 2006; L. Kanter: *Reconstructing the Renaissance: Saint James Freeing Hermogenes by Fra Angelico*, Fort Worth, New Haven and London 2008; and M. Warner: *Friendship and Loss in the Victorian Portrait: May Sartoris by Frederic Leighton*, Fort Worth, New Haven and London 2009.

[2] G.F. Waagen: *Treasures of Art in Great Britain*, London 1854–57, III, p.47.

[3] J.R. Martin: 'The Butcher's Shop of the Carracci', *The Art Bulletin* 45 (1963), pp.263–66.

[4] B. Wind: 'Annibale Carracci's "Scherzo": The Christ Church "Butcher Shop"', *The Art Bulletin* 58 (1976), pp.93–96; and F. Rossi: 'La "Macelleria" di Annibale Carracci e il bando per la quaresima del Cardinale Gabriele Paleotti', *Paragone* 565 (1997), pp.19–35.

[5] R. Zapperi: *Annibale Carracci. Ritratto di artista da giovane*, Turin 1989, esp. pp.45–69: 'L'epocea dei macellai'.

Firenze Milleseicentoquaranta: arti, lettere, musica, scienza. Edited by Elena Fumagalli, Alessandro Nova and Massimiliano Rossi. 432 pp. incl. 100 b. & w. ills. (Marsilio Editori S.P.A., Venice, 2010), €40. ISBN 978–88–317–08241.

Reviewed by HELEN LANGDON

THIS VOLUME BRINGS together a series of essays devoted to the arts and sciences in Florence in the 1640s that were first delivered as conference papers at the Kunsthistorisches Institut in Florence in 2008. This period remains relatively little studied, and the initiative was welcome.

The 1640s were marked, above all, by the presence in Florence of two very different artists, Pietro da Cortona and Salvator Rosa, the first who glorified the ambitious Medici dynasty with all the new splendour of the Roman Baroque, while the latter, painter-poet and actor, intrigued with his extravagant *napoletaneità* and charmed the literary academies with his wit and learning. They brought new life to a city struggling under the weight of a illustrious past, and the 1640s mark a turning point in Florentine culture. These essays, which open with a description of the melancholy last days of Galileo, and of the end of the brief period of enlightenment that '*il divino vecchio*' had so gloriously brought to Florence, are distinguished by their variety of viewpoints and methodologies. They bring together the history of art and architecture, literary history and the history of science, music and theatre, and as the essays unfold the intricate connections between varied spheres of activity and interest groups, and the discussion of the same figures in different roles and seen from different viewpoints, emerge with fresh life. In the introduction Massimiliano Rossi stresses that the aim of the convenors was not to reach an overriding view of the period, but to open up new areas of discourse and debate, and in this it is brilliantly successful.

A central theme is the unusual closeness of the arts in Florence, where many painters also wrote poetry, and several participated in the world of the theatre. Rodolfo Maffeis defines the idea of the Baroque in Florence, as revealed in such darkly erotic paintings as Francesco Furini's *Penitent Magdalene* (Kunsthistorisches Museum, Vienna; c.1642), or Cesare Dandini's *Lucrezia* (private collection, Florence; 1645–50), so far removed from the radiance of Pietro da Cortona, as a '*barocco in negativo*'; such paintings share the aesthetic of many gloomy lyrics by Marinisti poets, crowded with images of death and of skeletons, full of tension and unease. Around this theoretical essay cluster a number of more empirical studies of the sister arts. Two outstanding contributions are those of Paola Besuti and Maria Cristina Cabani, the first on Rosa and music, the second on Lorenzo Lippi's long and difficult poem *Il Malmantile Racquistato*. Besuti illumines, for the first time, how intelligent and informed a commentator on music Rosa was, setting his satire *La Musica* in the context of contemporary writings; she links poetry and painting, contrasting Rosa's unusually erotic *Arion* (private collection), associated with the licentious world of the *castrati* which Rosa condemned so vigorously, with the sweet simplicity of his *Music* (Palazzo Barberini, Rome), a personification of popular music far removed from the corruption of the court. Cabani's is a clear exposition of the many facets of the *Malmantile*, at once mock heroic, burlesque and playful, with an emphasis on word play and etymology, on Florentine folklore and popular culture, on the world of children and games. Lippi presents a closed world of private jokes and passions, and his friends, among them Rosa, appear as actors in his narrative.

And it is Rosa, far more than Cortona, who dominates this volume. In a sense Cortona remained, in the 1640s, curiously isolated, and Volterrano did not become a follower until the 1650s; in architecture the pull of tradition remained overwhelmingly powerful, and the possibilities of Cortona's new language were rejected. But Rosa, fêted by poets and men of letters, was at the centre of every world, admired and befriended even by the most famous of Galileo's pupils, and playing a key role in new kinds of drawing and theatre. In an ambitious essay on Rosa's self-portraits Victoria von Flemming analyses how Rosa himself dramatised his many roles through self-portraiture. But so many problems remain over the dating, attribution and status as self-portraits of the works which she discusses that this essay does not convince. It seems unlikely that the *Self-portrait as a warrior* (Banca Monte dei Paschi di Siena) is by Rosa and, in the present writer's view, *Philosophy* (National Gallery, London) is not a self-portrait. Von Flemming's elaborate reading of this work as Rosa, demanding silence from his chattering wife, Lucrezia, shown in the pendant (Wadsworth Atheneum, Hartford) as the personification of a degraded modern poetry, is an over-elaborate construction entirely lacking evidence. The *Self-portrait* (Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York) should have stood at the centre of this essay; many scholars have dated it to the 1650s, but recent research has placed it securely in the 1640s, and it is redolent of Rosa's Florentine enthusiasms.

The volume is, however, underpinned by a wealth of empirical research, of new documents, paintings and literary sources. Outstanding is Riccardo Spinelli's study of documents related to the patronage of the Niccolini, which describe the National Gallery's painting as '*un Filosofo*' and establish the date as 1641. The volume concludes with a useful summary by Elena Fumagalli of recent documentary research, which enrich the picture she has already sketched out in her exhibition catalogue *Napoli a Firenze nel Seicento* (2007).

Jules Hardouin-Mansart, 1646–1708. Edited by Alexandre Gady. 622 pp. incl. 413 col. + 94 b. & w. ills. (Editions de la Maison des sciences de l'homme, Paris, 2010), €96. ISBN 978–2–7351–1187–9.

Reviewed by GORDON HIGGOTT

'ARCHITECT' IS TOO limiting a term for the professional domain of Jules Hardouin-Mansart, for, as this splendid new study demonstrates, his artistic range was even wider than previously supposed, and his grip on the process of design and construction more secure than his later detractors would have had us believe. Co-ordinated by one of its principal authors, Alexandre Gady, this book is a worthy successor to Bertrand Jestaz's two-volume monograph, published in the tercentenary year, 2008.[1] Involving fifty-five contributors, it brings together papers from a conference in that year, general essays on the